

# ἄλλά

## I. General use.

### 1. Eliminative, substituting the true for the false.

(i) Here usually

(a) the ἄλλά clause (or sentence) is negative:

ἐκεῖθεν, ἄλλ' οὐκ ἐνθένδε, ἠρπάσθη (Pl. Phdr. 229d) ἐκ τούτων εἶναι τὸ πείθειν, ἄλλ' οὐκ ἐκ τῆς ἀληθείας (Pl. Phdr. 260a) ταῦτα πάντα γέγονε διὰ τὴν ἡμετέραν ἄνοιαν, ἄλλ' οὐ διὰ τὴν ἐκεῖνου δύναμιν (Isoc. IV 1, 37)

(b) the clause to which it is opposed, is negative:

Οὔτοι συνέχθην, ἄλλὰ συμφιλεῖν ἔφην (S. Ant. 523) φαίνεται γὰρ ἡ νῦν Ἑλλὰς καλουμένη οὐ πάσαι βεβαίως οἰκουμένη, ἄλλὰ μεταναστάσεις τε οὔσαι τὰ πρότερα (Th. I 2, 1) οὐ περὶ δόξης ... πολεμοῦσι, ἄλλ' ἀναστάσεως ... τῆς πατρίδος (D. I 5) (→ Hdt. I 88; Pl. Ly. 223a)

(a) and (b) combined:

Διττὰς ἄρα ταύτας οὐσίας καὶ κρίσεις τοῦ μεγάλου καὶ τοῦ μικροῦ θετέον, ἄλλ' οὐχ ὥς ἔφαμεν ἄρτι πρὸς ἄλληλα μόνον δεῖν, ἄλλ' ὥσπερ νῦν εἴρηται μᾶλλον τὴν μὲν πρὸς ἄλληλα λεκτέον, τὴν δ' αὖ πρὸς τὸ μέτρον (Pl. Plt. 283e) (→ Pl. R. 443c; Pl. Smp. 311e)

(ii) ἄλλ' οὐ and καὶ οὐ

The distinction between the two theoretically resides herein, that, strictly speaking, ἄλλ' οὐ expresses the incompatibility of two ideas, καὶ οὐ merely adds a negative idea to a positive. Hence the frequent use of ἄλλ' οὐ in contrasting what Chapman calls 'permanent opposites':

ἔστιν ἄλλ' οὐκ ὄναρ : ὄναρ ἄλλ' οὐκ ἰαστί : ἐμπειρίαν ἄλλ' οὐ τέχνην : ἀγαθὰ ἄλλὰ μὴ κακά.

Hence also, as Chapman observes, the 'slackening of interest' in the ἄλλ' οὐ clause, which merely restates negatively something already stated positively : whereas καὶ οὐ adds something really new and important:

Κλαίων ἄρ' ἄψη τῶνδε κοῦκ ἐς ἀμβολάς (,and soon, too') (E. Heracl. 270) καὶ σκεπτέον γε καὶ οὐκ ἀποκητέον (you can carry out an examination in a half-hearted way) (Pl. R. 372a) ἐν μόνῃ τῇ τοιαύτῃ πόλει τὸν τε σκυτοτόμον εὐρήσομεν καὶ οὐ κυβερνήτην πρὸς τῇ σκυτοτομίᾳ (,a cobbler, and nothing more than a cobbler') (Pl. R. 397e) τὸν ἐντυγχάνοντα οἷς λέγομεν καὶ μὴ κολάζοντα (Pl. Lg. 809a)

In rhetorical questions the order of relative importance is reversed, and the ἄλλ' οὐ clause bears the stress:

ἦ περὶ μικροῦ οἴεσθε νυνὶ κινδυνεύειν... ἄλλ' οὐ περὶ τούτου τοῦ κτήματος ὃ τῶν ὑμετέρων μέγιστον ὄν τυγχάνει; (Pl. La. 185a) (→ Pl. R. 366c)

In English, καὶ οὐ is usually best rendered 'and not', ἄλλ' οὐ 'not'. 'I want some blotting paper : red, and not too thick.' 'I want some blotting paper : red, not white.' Greek, like English, often dispenses with a connecting particle altogether: Αἵδης Ἀχιλλεύς ἦν ἄρ', οὐχ ὁ Πηλέως (E. IT 369).

The above distinction between ἄλλ' οὐ and καὶ οὐ is not, however, by any means always observed, even in the case of 'permanent opposites'. Deviations should be attributed, perhaps, to mere indifference rather than to any subtler motive:

Πρὸς βίαν ... καὶ μὴ δόλοισιν (S. Ph. 91) γνωτὰ κοῦκ ἄγνωτα (S. OT 58) πολλὰς τε κοῦχ ἄπαξ (S. OT 1275) ἄνω καὶ μὴ κάτω (E. Cyc. 211) ἐμμανῆς τε ἐὼν καὶ οὐ φρενήρης (Hdt. III 25) Ἑλληνικὸν καὶ οὐ βάρβαρον (Hdt. III 115) μάλιστα ἂν οὕτως ... εὐδοκιμοῖτε καὶ οὐκ ἐπαινοῖσθε - εὐδοκιμεῖν μὲν γὰρ ... ἐπαινεῖσθαι δὲ ... (Pl. Prt. 337b) (but there is no sense of substitution here, οὐκ ἐπαινοῖσθε being merely a parenthetical afterthought : hence neither ἄλλ' οὐ nor καὶ οὐ is really appropriate, and no connecting particle at all is needed. So, below, μάλιστα ἂν οὕτως εὐφρανοίμεθα, οὐχ ἠδοίμεθα - εὐφρανεσθαι μὲν γὰρ ἔστιν ...) πολλήν που συγγνώμην ἔχει καὶ οὐκ ὀργίζεται τοῖς ἀδίκους (Pl. R. 366c) ἀνερωτῶν ἡμᾶς αὐτοὺς εἰ ἢ αὐτῇ φύσει φαλακρῶν καὶ οὐχ ἢ ἐναντία (Pl. R. 454c) ἄλλ' εἶναι παιδιάν τινα καὶ οὐ σπουδὴν τὴν μίμησιν (Pl. R. 602b) τί δεῖ αὐτὸν αἰτεῖν καὶ οὐ λαβεῖν ἐλθόντα; (X. An. II 1,10)

Sometimes ἄλλ' οὐ and καὶ οὐ are used indifferently in closely parallel and nearly situated passages:

(iii) Certain varieties of the use of ἄλλά following a negative clause deserve special notice

(a) οὐ μόνον (οὐχ ὅπως) ... ἄλλὰ καὶ

(b) In some passages ἄλλά following a negative clause appears to mean 'except' (like ἄλλ' ἦ): as we say in English 'no one but you'

(c) Thucydides sometimes inserts a comparative adverb in the negative clause, and it has been said that in such cases ἄλλά has the force of ἦ.

(d) The colloquial μάλλ' (= μὴ ἄλλά) - 'No, don't say that, but', 'No, rather'

(e) A rhetorical question often takes the place of a negative clause

### 2. Balancing, sometimes answering a μὲν in the preceding clause

In the main, a poetical use.

(i) Without preceding μὲν

(ii) μὲν ... ἄλλά

### 3. Undetermined opposition.

In a great number of passages, intermediate between (1) and (2), ἄλλά simply expresses opposition, and it is left undetermined whether the opposite ideas are, or are not, incompatible. These examples occur most frequently in answers, less frequently in continuous speech, where the milder καίτοι is more regular.

(i) In answers, objecting to the previous speaker's words or behaviour.

(ii) In continuous speech. Common in Plato and the orators, rare in *unspoken Greek*. Usually, but not always, the objection is to the speaker's own words.

(iii) The speaker anticipates an objection which another is likely to make, 'But, you will say'.

## II. Special uses.

### 1. Following a rejected suggestion or supposition.

That which remains *sub judice*, and may still therefore be true, is contrasted with that which is already out of court. We may usually render 'well' or 'well then'.

- (i) ἄλλά introduces, not a fresh suggestion, but a question
- (ii) The speaker himself offers an alternative suggestion, either affirmative, interrogative, or imperative in form.
- (iii) The use of δ' ἄλλά in drama, and occasionally in prose dialogue, is similar, though here ἄλλά is adverbial rather than connective.
- (iv) Hypophora. Agan, the proffering and rejecting of successive suggestions may be done by a single speaker, who conducts, as it were, a dialogue with himself.

### 2. In the apodosis of a conditional (sometimes of a causal) sentence.

ἄλλά contrasts the ideas expressed in protasis and apodosis: 'if ... on the other hand', 'even though... still'.

### 3. A development of this use of ἄλλά in apodosis is to omit the protasis,

the sense of which can easily be supplied from the context. 'At least', 'At any rate', 'Well'.

### 4. In commands and exhortations.

### 5. In wishes or prayers.

This use is usually classed with (4), but (as regards (i)), it is essentially distinct.

- (i) An answer takes the form of a wish or prayer
- (ii) A wish or prayer is expressed, not at the opening of a speech, but during its course.

### 6. Assentient.

This use is at first sight diametrically opposed to the adversative. But in fact assent may include the idea of opposition in two contrary ways.

- (i) Practical consent, expression of willingness to act in a required way. Consent may be implied without being directly expressed:
  - (a) The enjoined task is described as easy or unobjectable
  - (b) A person asked to speak conveys his readiness to speak by speaking
- (ii) Assent, expressing agreement with a statement just made. This may be conveyed:
  - (a) By a favourable judgement of the preceding words.
  - (b) By a form of words implying that what has been said is correct.
- (iii) Again, ἄλλά may express, neither willingness to act as required, nor agreement with something stated or suggested, but:
  - (a) Acquiescence, ready or reluctant, in the attitude or declared intentions of the previous speaker: 'Well', 'Very good'
  - (b) A sympathetic reaction to the previous speaker's words or actions: 'Well'

7. We may perhaps class as assentient those passages in which ἄλλά introduces the substantiation by the second speaker of an hypothesis or wish expressed by the first, confirming as actual what has hitherto been presented as imaginary.

### 8. Inceptive. (Cf. Δέ, I.C.2.iii)

Speeches in Xenophon often open with ἄλλά.

- (i) Adversative.

### 9. Progressive.

We have observed above that ἄλλά, though normally a strong adversative, is sometimes used where we should expect the weaker δέ.

## III. Position.

As a strong adversative, ἄλλά naturally takes the first place in clause or sentence, while δέ, μέντοι and μήν take the second.

## IV. ἄλλά combined with other particles.

### 1. ἄλλά γε.

### 2. Ἄλλ' οὐδέ.

### 3. Ἄλλ' ἢ.

(i) A negation (or question expecting a negative answer), containing a word of comparison (some part of ἄλλος), is followed by an exception:

- (a)
- (b)

(ii) A negation, not containing a word of comparison, is followed by an exception.

(iii) Instead of a general negation, which has to be supplied in thought, a particular sentence is given.

### 4. Ἄλλ' ἢ.

### 5. Οὐ μήν ἄλλά.

- (i) General adversative use.
- (ii) In Demosthenes and Aristotle οὐ μήν ἄλλά sometimes introduces a supplementary argument which takes such marked precedence over the

# ἄλλά

previous argument that it is represented as contrasted with it, rather than as reinforcing it.

- (iii) Sometimes the argument thus stressed represents the speaker's second line of defence, or reserve position.

6. Οὐ μέντοι ἄλλά.

7. Οὐ γὰρ ἄλλά.

## Aus gImageReader gescannt:

Ἄλλά presents singularly few difficulties. Its clear and unchallenged etymology (from the neuter plural of ἄλλος, with change of accent<sup>1</sup>) is in complete accordance with its usage. The primary sense of 'otherness', diversity, contrast, runs through all the shades of meaning, from the strongest to the weakest: from 'but', or even 'no', to 'further', 'again'.

### I. General use, as an adversative connecting particle.

The adversative force of ἄλλά is usually strong (eliminative or objecting): less frequently, the particle is employed as a weaker (balancing) adversative. The distinction in force between ἄλλά and δέ is well illustrated in Pl.R.335A τὸν δὲ δοκοῦντα μὲν, ὄντα δὲ μὴ, δοκεῖν ἄλλά μὴ εἶναι φίλον : that between ἄλλά and μέντοι in Pl.Cra.432A.

(1) Eliminative, substituting the true for the false.

(i) Here usually, in the nature of things, either

(a) the ἄλλά clause (or sentence), or

(b) the clause to which it is opposed, is negative.

(a) Pl.Phdr.229D ἐκεῖθεν, ἄλλ' οὐκ ἐνθένδε, ἤρπασθη : 260A ἐκ τούτων εἶναι τὸ πείθειν, ἄλλ' οὐκ ἐκ τῆς ἀληθείας : Isoc.iv.137 ταῦτα πάντα γέγονε διὰ τὴν ἡμετέραν ἄνοιαν, ἄλλ' οὐ διὰ τὴν ἐκείνου δύναμιν.

(b) S.Ant.523 οὗτοι συνέχθειν, ἄλλά συμφιλεῖν ἔφυν : Th.i.2.1 φαίνεται γὰρ ἡ νῦν Ἑλλάς καλονμένη οὐ πάλα βεβαίως οἰκουμένη, ἄλλά μεταναστάσεις τε οὔσαι τὰ πρότερα : D.i 5 οὐ περι δόξης...πολεμοῦσιν, ἄλλ' ἀναστάσεως . . . τῆς πατρίδος : Hdt.i 88: Pl.Ly.223A. (a) and (b) combined. Pl.Plit.283E Διττὰς ἄρα ταύτας οὐσίας καὶ κρίνεις τοῦ μεγάλου καὶ τοῦ μικροῦ θετέον, ἄλλ' οὐχ ὡς ἔφαμεν ἄρτι πρὸς ἄλληλα μόνον δεῖν, ἄλλ' ὡσπερ νῦν εἴρηται μᾶλλον τὴν μὲν πρὸς ἄλληλα λεκτέον, τὴν δ' αὐτὴν πρὸς τὸ μέτριον : R.443C; Smp.211E.

(ii) ἄλλ' οὐ and καὶ οὐ<sup>2</sup>. The distinction between the two theoretically resides herein, that, strictly speaking, ἄλλ' οὐ expresses the incompatibility of two ideas, καὶ οὐ merely adds a negative idea to a positive. Hence the frequent use of ἄλλ' οὐ in contrasting what Chapman calls 'permanent opposites': ὕπαρ ἄλλ' οὐκ ὄναρ : δωριστι ἄλλ' οὐκ ἰαστί : ἐμπειρίαν ἄλλ' οὐ τέχνην : ἀγαθὰ ἄλλ' οὐ κακά. Hence also, as Chapman observes, the 'slackening of interest' in the ἄλλ' οὐ clause, which merely restates negatively something already stated positively: whereas καὶ οὐ adds something really new and important. E.Heracl.270 Κλαίων ἄρ' ἄψη τῶνδε κοῦκ ἐς ἀμβολὰς ('and soon, too') : Pl.R.372A καὶ σκεπτέον γὰρ καὶ οὐκ ἀποκητέον (you can carry out an examination in a half-hearted way): 397E: ἐν μὲν τῇ τοιαύτῃ πόλει τὸν τε σκυτοτόμον σκυτοτόμον εὐρήσομεν καὶ οὐ κυβερνήτην πρὸς τῇ σκυτοτομίᾳ ('a cobbler, and nothing more than a cobbler') : Lg.809A τὸν ἐντυγχάνοντα οἷς λέγομεν καὶ μὴ κολάζοντα. In rhetorical questions the order of relative importance is reversed, and the ἄλλ' οὐ clause bears the stress. Pl.La185A ἢ περὶ μικροῦ οἴεσθε νυνὶ κινδυνεύειν . . . ἄλλ' οὐ περι τούτου τοῦ κτήματος ὃ τῶν ὑμετέρων μέγιστον ὄν τυγχάνει; R.366C. In English, καὶ οὐ is usually best rendered 'and not', ἄλλ' οὐ 'not'. 'I want some blotting paper; red, and not too thick.' 'I want some blotting paper: red, not white.' Greek, like English, often dispenses with a connecting particle altogether: E.IT369 Αἴδης Ἀχιλλεὺς ἦν ἄρ', οὐχ ὁ Πηλέως.

The above distinction between ἄλλ' οὐ and καὶ οὐ is not, however, by any means always observed, even in the case of 'permanent opposites'. Deviations should be attributed, perhaps, to mere indifference rather than to any subtler motive. S.Ph.91 πρὸς βίαν . . . καὶ μὴ δόλοισιν : OT58 γνωτὰ κοῦκ ἄγνωτα : 1275 πολλάκις τε κοῦχ ἄπαξ : E.Cyc.211 ἄνω καὶ μὴ κάτω : Hdt.iii 25 ἐμμανὴς τε ἐὼν καὶ οὐ φρενήρης : 115 Ἑλληνικὸν καὶ οὐ βάρβαρον : Pl.Prt.337B μάλιστ' ἂν οὕτως . . . εὐδοκιοῦτε καὶ οὐκ ἐπαινοῖσθε – εὐδοκιοῦτε μὲν γὰρ . . . ἐπαινεῖσθαι δὲ . . . (but there is no sense of substitution here, οὐκ ἐπαινοῖσθε being merely a parenthetical afterthought: hence neither ἄλλ' οὐ nor καὶ οὐ is really appropriate, and no connecting particle at all is needed. So, below, μάλιστ' ἂν οὕτως: εὐφρανοίμεθα, οὐχ ἠδοίμεθα – εὐφραίνεσθαι μὲν γὰρ ἔστιν . . . ) : R.366C πολλὴν που συγγνώμην ἔχει καὶ οὐκ ὀργίζεται τοῖς ἀδίκοις : 454C ἀνερωτᾶν

<sup>1</sup> Or rather loss of accent. For the presence of a grave accent denotes nothing more than the absence of an acute or circumflex accent: see Wackernagel, *Beiträge zur Lehre vom griechischen Akzent*, p. 15.

<sup>2</sup> I owe much here to Dr. R. W. Chapman's analysis of Platonic use.

**ἀλλά**